

Minutes of the Eighty-sixth Meeting of the Advisory Committee on Assisted Reproductive Technology

Held on 13 August 2020, online.

Present

Kathleen Logan (Chair)
Colin Gavaghan (Deputy Chair)
Calum Barrett
Jonathan Darby
Sue McKenzie
Karen Reader
Analosa Veukiso-Ulugia
Sarah Wakeman

Non-members present

Martin Kennedy, ACART Secretariat
Hayley Robertson, ACART Secretariat
Joel Tyrie, ACART Secretariat

1. Welcome

- 1.1 The Chair opened the meeting at 9.00 am and welcomed the Committee members and Secretariat.
- 1.2 On this occasion, no ECART member attended and the Chair of ACART will give the Chair of ECART an update on the status of ACART's programme.
- 1.3 The Chair noted the new appointments to ACART made on 6 August 2020. The Chair acknowledged and thanked the outgoing members for their work and longstanding service to the Committee.
- 1.4 The outgoing members shared some reflections of their time in the Committee and thanked the Committee and Secretariat for their work during their terms.

2. Apologies

- 2.1 None.

3. Approval of the agenda

- 3.1 Members approved the agenda.

Action

- *Secretariat to place the August 2020 agenda on ACART's website.*

4. Declarations of Interests

- 4.1 No conflicts of interest were declared at this meeting.

5. Minutes of ACART's meeting of June 2020

- 5.1 The minutes were approved.

Action

- *Secretariat to place the June 2020 minutes on ACART's website.*

6. Actions arising from ACART's June meeting

- 6.1 Members noted the status of the actions from the June meeting, including those actions that were carried over to today's meeting.

7. Work programme status

- 7.1 Members noted the status of the work programme.

Monitoring and reporting

8. Member reports on papers/research

- 8.1 No reports this session.

9. Report on ECART's April meeting

9.1 Members noted the report.

Projects

10. Review of the guidelines for posthumous reproduction: update on consultation

10.1 Members noted that the stage two consultation for the review of the guidelines went live on 15 July 2020. The Secretariat told members that the consultation was emailed to ACART's stakeholder list as well as all of those who engaged with the stage one consultation on this topic. It was noted that individuals have the opportunity to also submit verbally if they wish. The Chair informed members that a few days prior to the ACART meeting, the Chair and the Secretariat met via zoom with one of the fertility clinics to discuss the consultation.

10.2 The Secretariat advised that the consultation closes on 9 September 2020. The Secretariat will brief members on the key themes from the feedback received at the next ACART meeting in October 2020.

10.3 Members asked the Secretariat to check the closing date that was provided to the public and to send supplementary details about the closing date if needed.

Action

- *Check the closing date that was provided to the public and to send supplementary details about the closing date if needed.*

11. The regulatory setting and ACART's functions: approve a standing document for ACART's website

11.1 ACART thanked the Secretariat for producing this document and reviewed and amended the draft document as necessary.

Action

- *Tracked changes were added to the document; all changes will be finalised by the Chair and the Secretariat.*

12. Consultation on the use of cryopreserved testicular tissue

12.1 Members discussed the current status of the use of cryopreserved testicular tissue and the benefits of amending the Human Assisted Reproductive Technology Order to explicitly state that the use of such tissue is an established procedure.

12.2 Members read and reviewed the draft consultation document and asked the Secretariat to make some minor changes to improve the clarity of the document. The Secretariat informed members that the reproductive advisory committees and health departments in the United Kingdom, Australia and Canada had been

contacted for information about their policies and regulation for using cryopreserved testicular tissue.

- 12.3 Members were happy with the proposed consultation questions and agreed that, subject to the changes discussed and subject to a thorough review by a member with Māori expertise, the document should be formatted and edited by the Ministry of Health and readied for publication.

Actions

- *Tracked changes to be finalised by the Chair and Secretariat.*
- *Secretariat to continue investigating the international literature on this topic, including policies adopted by other countries for using testicular tissue from pre-pubertal boys.*
- *Secretariat to progress the document through editing and formatting to ready for publication.*

13. Amend the guidelines for extending storage of gametes and embryos: discuss the revised draft consultation document

- 13.1 ACART reviewed and amended the draft consultation document.
- 13.2 ACART discussed practical issues of the limits of donor consent at the time of donation compared with reconsenting at the time of storage extension.
- 13.3 Members noted the various factors that can have a bearing on if, and to what extent, a person might be said to have an interest in the gametes or embryos they have donated. These factors include (a) having gametes in the embryo (b) having had the embryo created for their own use (c) having a child or children that would be siblings to children that would be born from the donated gametes or embryos (d) whose family any existing children (who would be siblings) are in.

Actions

- *Ensure the views of donors are sought during the consultation.*
- *Secretariat and Chair to discuss whether the document should ask if donors should be asked to consent to storage extensions at all given that storage is quite different to use and consent is required for use anyway.*
- *Adjust the structure of the document to present a proposal/question, followed by the rationale for that proposal only, before presenting the next proposal.*
- *Investigate a recent consultation done in the UK on a similar issue.*
- *Discuss with ECART whether there is a limit to the duration of storage extensions and if so, how long is that limit.*
- *Ensure a distinction is made throughout the document between embryos that were donated and those that were created for the people now seeking an extension.*
- *Other changes and edits as discussed and recorded as tracked changes in the revised draft consultation document.*

14. Data on treatment by ethnicity: for discussion

- 14.1 ACART discussed Fertility New Zealand's plans to start collecting and recording ethnicity data.
- 14.2 ACART noted that ethnicity data is useful for recording ethnicity-based inequalities in treatment provision and outcomes. However, most assisted reproductive procedures are through private providers and therefore data from those clinics is likely to represent those who can afford the relatively high costs of private treatment.
- 14.3 ACART noted that the collection of ethnicity data is useful in providing data on which groups are accessing fertility services. Ethnicity data will also inform ACART as to which ethnic groups are not accessing fertility services, which could help guide ACART in promoting equitable access to fertility services if it were to have such a role.

Actions

- *ACART to write to the Fertility Society of Australia to suggest they record the ethnicity of people seeking and obtaining fertility services.*
- *ACART Chair, Analosa Veukiso-Ulugia and Secretariat to meet with appropriate persons from the Māori Health Directorate at the Ministry of Health to discuss further.*
- *Investigate whether fertility service providers currently record multiple ethnicities, and if so, how.*

Consultations by other parties

15. Proposed amended standards for fertility and other health services: for comment

- 15.1 Members were glad the Secretariat had laid out the proposed response from ACART to the proposed standards, in particular as the response notes some concerns about the difficult format of the draft consultation document and consequent difficulty analysing the proposed standards.
- 15.2 ACART noted that a person-centred approach with regards to accessing information should be acknowledged in the document.

Action

- *ACART members will review the document further outside of the meeting, and send any feedback to the Secretariat.*

Standing items

16. Correspondence and enquiries: for noting

- 16.1 The Committee noted the letter to Associate Minister of Health Jenny Salesa about the publication of ACART's revised Surrogacy and Donation Guidelines.

17.a Governance — Chair's Report

- 17.1 Members noted the report.

17.b Members' reports, including reports from conferences

- 17.2 Nil to report

18 Secretariat report

- 18.1 The Secretariat reported that budget bids for 2021 had taken place, and a bid for ACART to host a Sector Day has been included in this bid.

- 18.2 The Secretariat proposed dates for ACART to meet in 2021. The dates were as follows:

- 18 February 2021
- 15 April 2021
- 10 June 2021
- 12 August 2021
- 21 October 2021
- 9 December 2021.

Actions

- *Confirm availability for proposed meeting dates with all members, including new members not present at this meeting.*
- *Secretariat to send new members the summary document of the status of ACART's work.*

19 Conclusion of meeting and next meeting dates

- 19.1 The Secretariat confirmed the key work items to be undertaken between meetings.

20 ACART members at upcoming ECART meetings

- 20.1 Members noted the dates of the upcoming ECART meetings and who would attend:
- Analosa Veukiso-Ulugia confirmed she will attend ECART's meeting on 3

September 2020.

- Karen Reader confirmed she will attend ECART's meeting on 29 October 2020.
- Calum Barrett confirmed he will attend ECART's meeting on 17 December 2020.

Action

- *Secretariat to advise ECART of the upcoming meeting details.*

20.2 The meeting closed at 2:30pm.