Advisory Committee on Assisted Reproductive Technology Annual Report 2011/12

Citation: ACART. 2012. Advisory Committee on Assisted Reproductive Technology: Annual report 2011/12. Wellington: Advisory Committee on Assisted Reproductive Technology.

> Published in October 2012 by the Advisory Committee on Assisted Reproductive Technology PO Box 5013, Wellington 6145, New Zealand

> > ISBN: 978-0-478-40208-7 (online) HP 5583

This document is available on the ACART website: www.acart.health.govt.nz



Foreword

On behalf of the Advisory Committee on Assisted Reproductive Technology (ACART) I am pleased to present this Annual Report. It covers the 2011/12 reporting year, for the first four months of which Professor Sylvia Rumball was the Chair.

This seventh year of ACART's existence has seen considerable changes in personnel. Professor Rumball's tenure as the inaugural chair ended in October 2011. Two new members joined the Committee: Judy Turner and Michael Legge. Deputy Chair Richard Randerson and Gareth Jones ended their terms. The number of members reduced from nine to eight.

The Committee completed a considerable programme of work in the year, details of which are set out in this report. Significant projects included the development of guidelines on extended storage of gametes and embryos, which have now been issued; further work to prepare advice on import and export of gametes and embryos; and work on advice about informed consent requirements. The Committee's most significant new work was in response to a complaint to the Human Rights Commission that the existing guidelines on surrogacy discriminated against gay men. The mediation that followed the complaint led in late 2011 to ACART initiating a review of some aspects of the surrogacy guidelines.

The complexity of ACART's work has continued to increase. New techniques and uses of assisted reproductive technologies in circumstances not previously contemplated raise new challenges to existing guidelines and processes. Societal acceptance of such uses is changing. The choice of a growing number of New Zealanders to access assisted reproductive services in other countries with different regulations creates demands that New Zealand regulations be modified.

I am grateful to ACART members for their commitment to the Committee's work and their willingness to provide both time and expertise. Without such involvement the progress achieved would not have been possible. I particularly wish to thank the three members whose terms ended in the past year: Professor Sylvia Rumball, Professor Gareth Jones, who was also a foundation member, and Bishop Richard Randerson. Professor Rumball led ACART through its formative years and set a high standard of professionalism in this as in other responsibilities she has held.

In the course of its work programme in the period this report covers, ACART interacted closely with the Ethics Committee on Assisted Reproductive Technology (ECART), the Ministry of Health and providers of fertility services. Information and insights from these sources are of considerable assistance to ACART in implementing its responsibilities under the Human Assisted Reproductive Technology Act 2004 (the HART Act).

The Committee has been very ably supported by the staff members in the Secretariat. I wish to record my thanks here for their high level of professionalism and to the Ministry of Health for its ongoing support. The Committee also has a constructive relationship with the Minister of Health, the Hon Tony Ryall.

Finally, I wish to express my appreciation to those who have assisted ACART's work by responding to requests for submissions. Members of various groups and organisations, and individual members of the public, have been most helpful; their feedback is a valuable contribution to our thinking.

Dr John Angus Chair, Advisory Committee on Assisted Reproductive Technology

Acknowledgement

Acknowledgement of Professor Sylvia Rumball CNZM Inaugural Chair 2005–2011

Professor Emeritus Sylvia Rumball was the inaugural chair of ACART, leading the Committee's work from its first meeting in September 2005. Sylvia came to the role of chair as an academic, scientist and ethicist with an international reputation.

Sylvia had already played a major role in the development of New Zealand's regulatory framework for assisted reproductive technology. She was chair of the former National Ethics Committee on Assisted Human Reproduction from 2002 to 2005, when it was replaced by ACART and ECART. She was also a member of the former Advisory Group on Assisted Reproductive Technologies, which reported to the Director-General of Health in March 2005 on the clinical risks and benefits associated with various procedures.

ACART completed a wide range of significant and challenging projects under Sylvia's leadership, including issuing guidelines to ECART on several assisted reproductive procedures and providing advice to successive Ministers of Health on various matters, including human reproductive research.

ACART benefited from Sylvia's strong commitment to a policy process based on evidence and grounded in the principles of the HART Act. Sylvia worked hard to build local and international relationships with the fertility sector, ECART, the Ministry of Health, successive ministers and peers in other jurisdictions.

Sylvia's approach to chairing was very inclusive, valuing and encouraging the contribution of all members. She was very supportive of the Secretariat, and always available to discuss and review papers and plan meetings.

Contents

orewordiii
Acknowledgementv
ntroduction1
Purpose of this report1
Background1
ACART's functions1
ACART's work during 2011/12
ACART processes
Key projects in 2011/12
ACART's monitoring functions5
Governance6
Contact with the Minister of Health6
Conference attendance
Member training
Publications7
CART decisions 2011/128
Appendices
Appendix 1: ACART membership9
Appendix 2: Member attendance at full ACART meetings16
Appendix 3: ACART working groups17

Introduction

Purpose of this report

Section 42(3) of the HART Act requires ACART, as soon as practicable after each 12-month period ending on 30 June, to provide the Minister of Health with a report on:

- its progress in carrying out its functions
- the number and kinds of decisions made by ECART in that period.

Background

ACART was established under section 32 of the HART Act, and first met in September 2005. Appendix 1 gives biographical information on ACART's membership during 2011/12 (including current, departed and new members).

ACART's functions

ACART's functions, as set out in section 35 of the HART Act, are to:

- issue guidelines and give advice to ECART on the matters that ECART must take into account in considering whether to give, change or cancel an approval for an extension to the applicable period for the storage of a human *in vitro* gamete or a human *in vitro* embryo
- issue guidelines and give advice to ECART on any matter relating to any kind of assisted reproductive procedure or human reproductive research, and keep such guidelines and advice under review
- advise the Minister of Health on aspects of, or issues arising out of, kinds of assisted reproductive research and, without limitation, provide advice as to whether:
 - the HART Act or another enactment should be amended to prohibit or provide for any kind of assisted reproductive procedure or human reproductive research
 - any kind of procedure or treatment should be declared an established procedure (that is, a procedure that does not require ECART approval) on the basis of the information, assessment, advice and ethical analysis required under section 6 of the HART Act
 - any established procedure should be modified or should cease to be an established procedure
 - a moratorium should be imposed on any kind of assisted reproductive procedure or human reproductive research
 - regulations should be made under section 76 of the HART Act to regulate the performance of any kind of assisted reproductive procedure or the conduct of any kind of human reproductive research

- liaise with ECART on general and specific matters relating to assisted reproductive procedures or human reproductive research
- consult with anyone who, in the opinion of ACART, is able to assist it to perform its functions
- perform any other function that the Minister of Health assigns to it by written notice.

For the purposes of performing the above functions, ACART must monitor:

- the application, and health outcomes, of assisted reproductive procedures and established procedures
- developments in human reproductive research.

ACART's Terms of Reference are available on its website www.acart.health.govt.nz

ACART's work during 2011/12

ACART processes

ACART's work programme is established in consultation with the Minister of Health. The Committee's most recent consultation with the Minister was in April 2012.

ACART's work in 2011/12 was carried out at full ACART meetings and through a series of meetings of working groups on various specific issues. ACART draws heavily on the Secretariat to prepare papers for working group meetings and subsequent reports to ACART. (Appendix 3 sets out further information on working group membership and projects.)

ACART met as a full committee, with the support of the Secretariat, six times during 2011/12. (Appendix 2 sets out member attendance at these meetings.)

There was one formal meeting with the Minister in the period covered by this report.

Key projects in 2011/12

ACART's work in 2011/12 included creating and reviewing guidelines and developing advice to the Minister, as outlined below.

Guidelines on Extending the Storage Period of Gametes and Embryos

Parliament passed the Human Assisted Reproductive Technology (Storage) Amendment Act in October 2010. This legislation clarified that the statutory 10-year limit for the storage of gametes and embryos came into effect from 2004, and that ACART's role includes issuing guidelines and giving advice to ECART on matters that ECART must take into account in considering whether to give, change or cancel an approval to extend the storage period of gametes and embryos beyond 10 years, or beyond an approved extended storage period.

ACART reviewed submissions received during public consultation in 2011 on proposed guidelines, and forwarded the revised guidelines to the Minister of Health for consultation in February 2012. After completing consultation with the Minister, ACART issued the guidelines to ECART on 30 August to come into effect on 3 September.

Review of eligibility criteria in *Guidelines on Surrogacy Arrangements* involving Providers of Fertility Services and *Guidelines on Donation of Eggs* or Sperm between Certain Family Members

ACART received a complaint from a male couple in August 2011, through the Human Rights Commission, that ACART's *Guidelines on Surrogacy Arrangements involving Providers of Fertility Services* discriminate on the basis of sex and sexual orientation, because the guidelines require ECART to determine that the 'intending mother' must meet criteria based on medical need.

ACART agreed that the policy was prima facie discriminatory. After considering evidence about parenting by single men and male couples, ACART concluded that the reference to 'intending mother' in the surrogacy guidelines was unjustified discrimination in light of the principles of the HART Act 2004. Accordingly, the Committee decided that the medical criteria would also need to change, since in the case of a single man or a male couple the need for a surrogate is circumstantial, not medical.

ACART treated this project as a priority in order to remove unjustified discrimination as soon as possible. By June 2012 it had completed work on a consultation document about proposed amendments to the *Guidelines on Surrogacy Arrangements involving Providers* of Fertility Services and the *Guidelines on Donation of Eggs or Sperm between Certain Family Members*. Consultation began in the second half of 2012.

Selection of embryos using pre-implantation genetic diagnosis

In May 2009 ACART consulted with the Minister on guidelines for the use of preimplantation genetic diagnosis with human leukocyte antigen tissue typing. The Minister subsequently asked the National Ethics Advisory Committee (NEAC) to provide him with advice on the guidelines.

After receiving NEAC's advice in August 2009, the Minister invited ACART to comment on some matters raised by NEAC. ACART subsequently presented amended guidelines to the Minister in July 2011. The guidelines have been discussed with the Minister and await a formal response.

Advice to the Minister of Health on human reproductive research

Section 37 of the HART Act requires ACART to provide the Minister of Health with information, advice and, if it thinks fit, recommendations on certain matters in relation to the use of gametes and embryos in human reproductive research.

ACART provided the Minister of Health with advice on human reproductive research in June 2007 following extensive public consultation in the 2006/07 financial year. At the request of the Minister of Health, ACART has not undertaken any work to develop guidelines or further advice.

As noted on page 6, ACART continues to monitor human reproductive research, including statutory requirements in other jurisdictions.

Advice to the Minister of Health on import and export of gametes and embryos

The movement of gametes and embryos in and out of New Zealand may be seen in the context of recent growth in cross-border reproductive care. Under the HART Act, ACART is required to:

- provide the Minister of Health with information, advice and, if it thinks fit, recommendations on the import into, or export from, New Zealand of *in vitro* human gametes or *in vitro* human embryos in respect of human reproductive research (section 37(1)(g))
- provide the Minister of Health with information, advice and, if it thinks fit, recommendations on the import into, or export from, New Zealand of *in vitro* donated cells or *in vitro* donated embryos in relation to human assisted reproductive technology (section 38(f)).

ACART's project to develop advice on these matters is now well advanced, with a consultation document in progress. ACART anticipates undertaking public consultation on its proposed advice early in 2013, and is giving priority to this project.

Advice to the Minister of Health on informed consent

ACART is required to provide the Minister of Health with advice on requirements for informed consent in relation to the use of gametes and embryos in human reproductive research (section 37(1)(f) of the HART Act), and in relation to human assisted reproductive technology (section 38(d)).

ACART's current work to develop advice on informed consent is focused on the context of human assisted reproductive technology. ACART has concluded that informed consent in the context of human reproductive research is best addressed as part of any future work on human reproductive research.

ACART's monitoring functions

Over 2011/12, ACART carried out its monitoring functions as outlined below.

Monitoring the application and health outcomes of assisted reproductive procedures and established procedures

Section 35(2) of the HART Act requires ACART to monitor the application and health outcomes of assisted reproductive procedures and established procedures.

To date, ACART has monitored the outcomes of assisted reproductive procedures through the annual report of the Australia and New Zealand Assisted Reproduction Database (ANZARD). It also monitors international trends through the reports of organisations such as the European Society of Human Reproduction and Embryology and the International Federation of Fertility Societies.

During 2011/12 ACART was in discussion with the University of New South Wales about a contract to produce a New Zealand-specific report on numbers and types of assisted reproductive treatments, based on the annual ANZARD report (which in most aspects combines Australian and New Zealand data). This report, expected in late 2012, will be published on ACART's website.

Monitoring developments in human reproductive research

Section 35(2) of the HART Act also requires ACART to monitor developments in human reproductive research.

During 2011/12 ACART continued its established practice of monitoring relevant human reproductive research through circulating papers of interest to members, including journal articles, reports from conference attendance and international horizon scanning reports. This has enabled ACART to learn about procedures which may come to notice as being of interest to New Zealanders. Research of interest to ACART includes findings from social sciences research concerned with the psychosocial outcomes of assisted reproduction for adults and children.

In addition, throughout 2011/12 the Chair of ACART has met with several fertility service providers and researchers, as the opportunity has arisen, to share information and ensure ACART is kept informed of issues and trends affecting the fertility sector.

Monitoring the decisions of ECART

ACART's terms of reference require it to monitor ECART's decisions, to ensure they fall within the guidelines set by ACART. The Secretariat summarises ECART's decisions prior to each ACART committee meeting to assist ACART to carry out this role.

In April 2012, the Chair asked the Secretariat to provide ACART with a paper identifying options for the future operation of this function, with a view to clarifying some uncertainties about its purpose and scope. The requested paper is under consideration.

Governance

Chair

Dr John Angus was appointed as Chair of ACART in October 2011 following the completion of the term of the establishment Chair, Professor Sylvia Rumball.

Deputy Chair

Members selected Associate Professor Andrew Shelling as Deputy Chair, to replace the former Deputy Chair, Bishop Richard Randerson, whose term had ended.

Contact with the Minister of Health

ACART's Chair met the Minister of Health on 5 April 2012, accompanied by the Chair of ECART.

Conference attendance

ACART's Chair attended the Bioethics Conference 'No Country for Old Men (or Women): Increasing Pressures on the Health Care System' at the University of Otago in January 2012.

Member training

ACART held a training day for new members in November 2011. The programme included presentations on ACART's processes and work; the role of the Ministry of Health in relation to ACART's work; bioethics in a Māori context; consumer perspectives; and the work of fertility counsellors.

Members also participated in a workshop in June 2012 to provide feedback on a draft ethical framework commissioned from Professor Gareth Jones, Otago University. This framework is intended to set out the principles that guide ACART's deliberations and frame its decisions, and also to help ACART make explicit the moral principles underpinning its guidelines and advice.

Publications

ACART published on its website (www.acart.health.govt.nz):

- its Annual Report 2010/11
- agendas of ACART meetings, after each meeting
- minutes of ACART meetings, after their confirmation at each following meeting.

ECART decisions 2011/12

Between 1 July 2011 and 30 June 2012 ECART considered 47 applications for assisted reproductive procedures and human reproductive research. There were:

- eight applications for surrogacy arrangements involving fertility providers
- 15 applications for gamete donation between certain family members
- 15 applications for embryo donation for reproductive purposes
- seven applications for the creation and use, for reproductive purposes, of an embryo created from donated eggs in conjunction with donated sperm
- two applications for research on gametes or non-viable embryos.

Of these applications, 34 were approved outright, 10 were approved subject to conditions, two were deferred and one was declined.

The details of these decisions are set out in ECART's Annual Report 2011/12.

Appendix 1: ACART membership

ACART members

Current members

Dr John Angus – Chair (from November 2011) Associate Professor Andrew Shelling – Deputy Chair Dr Karen Buckingham Alison Douglass Cilla Henry Nikki Horne Judy Turner (from November 2011) Associate Professor Michael Legge (from November 2011)

Other members during the period

Professor Sylvia Rumball – Chair (to October 2011) Bishop Richard Randerson – Deputy Chair (to October 2011) Professor Gareth Jones (to October 2011)

Secretariat members

Betty-Ann Kelly, senior policy analyst Vicky Baynes, policy analyst Megan Larken, senior policy analyst (to June 2012) Chris Wilson, policy analyst (from May 2012)

Additional administrative support was provided by the Business Services and Committee Support team in the Policy Business Unit of the Ministry of Health; in particular Helen Martin.

9

Biographies of ACART members

Current members

John Angus MNZM (Chair)

Dr John Angus was appointed as an ACART member in November 2010 for three years, and subsequently appointed as chair in October 2011 for one year.

John was Children's Commissioner from 2009 to 2011. Prior to that, he had a long career as a senior social policy advisor within the Ministry of Social Development and its predecessors (1987–2006), and then as a social policy consultant (2006–2009).

John began his career as a historian after obtaining a BA (Hons) (1971) and then a doctorate in history from the University of Otago (1977). He went on to spend almost 10 years as a social worker in Dunedin for the Department of Social Welfare, and completed a Diploma in Social Work (Victoria University 1982). John then moved into social policy.

John has led policy work on child support, the care and protection of children and support for vulnerable families. He played a leading role in the development of several family support initiatives, such as Family Start and SKIP. From early 2008 to April 2009, he led work on the prevention of child abuse and neglect for the Taskforce for Action on Violence Within Families.

John lives in Central Otago and is married with two adult sons.

Andrew Shelling (Deputy Chair)

Associate Professor Andrew Shelling was appointed to ACART in August 2006 and will have completed two terms in November 2012, when he retires as a member.

Andrew is head of the Medical Genetics Research Group, which is primarily interested in understanding the molecular changes that occur during the development of genetic disorders, focusing on infertility and reproductive cancers. He has a special interest in understanding the cause of premature menopause, and his research is internationally recognised for identifying genetic causes of this common cause of infertility. He initiated the development of a support group for women with premature menopause in New Zealand.

Andrew is currently deputy head of the Department of Obstetrics and Gynaecology, University of Auckland, and is extensively involved in teaching reproduction, genetics and cancer at the university. He has recently served as president of the New Zealand branch of the Human Genetics Society of Australasia. He is currently an associate editor of the journal *Human Reproduction*, one of the leading journals in the area of reproductive research. He is a trustee for the Nurture Foundation for Reproductive Research.

Karen Buckingham

Dr Karen Buckingham was appointed to ACART in November 2010 for three years.

Karen is a graduate of the Auckland School of Medicine and trained as an obstetrician and gynaecologist in both New Zealand and the United Kingdom. She worked as a senior lecturer at the University of Auckland from 2003 to 2008 and as a consultant obstetrician and gynaecologist for the Auckland District Health Board from 2003 to 2012. For the past 12 years she has worked mainly in the field of reproductive endocrinology and infertility. She now works in private practice for Repromed and Auckland Gynaecology Group.

Karen has held a wide range of clinical, teaching and research roles in New Zealand and overseas. Her research interests include recurrent pregnancy loss, polycystic ovarian syndrome and antiphospholipid antibodies in infertility.

She lives in Auckland with her husband and three young children.

Alison Douglass

Alison Douglass was appointed to ACART in May 2011 for three years.

Alison is a barrister, practising out of Wellington and Dunedin. She has been a practising lawyer since 1985, and specialises in health and disability law. Prior to moving to the independent bar in 2008 Ms Douglass was a partner, then consultant, to a Wellington law firm, Tripe Matthews and Feist. She completed an LLB at Canterbury University (1984) and a Master of Bioethics and Health Law at University of Otago (1999).

Alison is currently co-chair of the ACC Research Ethics Committee and convenor of the New Zealand Law Society Health Law Committee, which provides submissions on health law reform. She was the legal member to the Interim, then National Ethics Committee on Assisted Human Reproduction (1993–2002) prior to the enactment of the HART Act, and is a former chair of the Wellington Ethics Committee. She has worked part time as a senior lecturer in health law and bioethics at the University of Otago, Wellington.

Alison has published journal articles on assisted reproductive technology, and in 2006 prepared the *Report on the Regulatory Framework Governing Assisted Reproductive Technologies in New Zealand* for the Ministry of Health.

She lives in Dunedin and is married with three children.

Cilla Ruruhira Henry QSM

Cilla Henry was appointed to ACART in July 2007, and will have completed two terms when she retires as a member in November 2012.

Cilla grew up under the mantle of the Kīngitanga movement, deeply entrenched in Waikato kawa (protocol) and tikanga (teachings). Her hapū connections are Ngāti Wairere and Ngāti Hako Hauraki.

Cilla is a Te Kauhanganui tribal representative, Hukanui Marae; a Māori specialist consultant in the bicultural therapy model for the Department of Corrections Psychological Services, Hamilton, working with Māori inmates at Waikeria Prison; a trustee of Raukura Waikato Social Services; and a consumer representative for the Ministry of Consumer Affairs.

She is also a member of the National Council of Women and the Māori Women's Welfare League, and a representative on the Care and Protection Panel for Children and their Families (Child, Youth and Family). She was appointed a justice of the peace in 1996 and received the Queen's Service Medal for public service in 2003.

Nikki Horne

Nikki Horne was appointed to ACART in November 2010 for two years.

Nikki is a member of Fertility New Zealand, the national group for consumers of fertility services. She has served as a committee member of the Auckland Group for four years, and her specific roles have included facilitating consumer contact support groups and clinic liaison.

Nikki currently works part time as the business support manager at Career Analysts in Auckland. Before this role she worked for eight years as event manager for Obex Medical Ltd. Her time there included managing all events, conferences and functions for the company across a broad range of medical specialties, including embryology.

Nikki is married with two daughters, both born after years of IVF treatment and recurrent miscarriage. After completing her family Nikki was an egg donor for another couple.

Michael Legge

Associate Professor Michael Legge was appointed to ACART in October 2011 for one year.

Michael recently retired as Associate Professor of Biochemistry, Associate Dean of Medical Education and Director of Medical Laboratory Science at the University of Otago, and holds an Honorary Associate Professorship with the university. He was previously National President of the Infertility Society of New Zealand (1995–1998). He is a member of the European Commission Ethical Review Panel (2006–present), the European Commission Life Science Expert Panel (2003–present) and the University of Otago Human Ethics Committee (2000–2011).

Michael completed a PhD in Experimental Embryology at the University of Essex (1988) and a Bachelor of Science in Mammalian Physiology at Southbank University, United Kingdom (1972). He also completed a Fellowship with the Royal College of Pathologists Australasia (2010), and is a fellow of both the New Zealand Institute of Medical Laboratory Sciences (1978) and the Institute of Biomedical Sciences United Kingdom (1973).

Judy Turner

Mrs Judy Turner was appointed to ACART in October 2011, for one year.

Judy is currently Deputy Mayor of Whakatane District Council (2011–present). Prior to this, she was a contractor in the community and charitable sector, and was previously a Member of Parliament (2002–2008). She is currently a trustee for the Life Education Trust (Eastern Bay of Plenty), a trustee for Habitat for Humanity (Eastern Bay of Plenty) and an Advisory Board member for Whakatane Youth Engagement Services, to name a few such positions. She is also deputy leader of United Future.

Members whose term ended during 2011/12

Sylvia Rumball CNZM (Chair to October 2011)

Professor Emeritus Sylvia Rumball was until recently assistant to the Vice Chancellor (Research Ethics) at Massey University. She has a PhD in chemistry, and for many years taught chemistry and undertook research in structural biology at Massey University.

She has extensive international, national and local experience on ethics committees and ethics-related bodies through past membership of the United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO) International Bioethics Committee, the New Zealand National Commission for UNESCO, the Health Research Council Ethics Committee, the Massey University Human Ethics Committee and the MASH Trust Ethics Committee; through current membership of the Ethics Advisory Panel of the Environmental Risk Management Authority; as a past chair of the National Ethics Committee on Assisted Human Reproduction; and as a past chair of the Massey University Human Ethics Committee.

Sylvia is a member of the International Council for Science Committee on Freedom and Responsibility in Science, a former member of the Massey University Council, an auditor for the New Zealand Universities Academic Audit Unit and a former member of the board of the National Centre for Advanced Bio-Protection Technologies.

In 1998 Sylvia was made an Officer of the New Zealand Order of Merit for services to science, and in 2008 she was promoted to Companion. She is also the recipient of a Palmerston North City Council Civic Award, a Distinguished Alumni Award from the University of Canterbury and a New Zealand Science and Technology medal. She retired from Massey University in 2009 after more than 40 years of service.

Richard Randerson CNZM (Deputy Chair to October 2011)

Bishop Richard Randerson was born in Takapuna and studied at Otago University in arts and theology. He later undertook postgraduate studies in New York City and San Francisco in ethics and socioeconomics.

Ordained as an Anglican priest in Auckland in 1965, and bishop in 1994, Richard has served in a variety of ministries in New Zealand, the United States, the United Kingdom and Australia. His roles have included industrial chaplain, inner city minister, social justice officer, bishop (in Canberra) and dean of Auckland's Holy Trinity Cathedral. He has played a prominent role in the media, speaking and writing on issues such as poverty and justice, race relations, peace and inter-faith dialogue, and social ethics.

In 2000/01 the New Zealand Government appointed Richard to the four-person Royal Commission on Genetic Modification. In this role he engaged in extensive consultation with the New Zealand public, both at open meetings and with Māori on marae. The interface between science, ethics and the public good was central to the Commission's work.

Richard is the author of three books: *Christian Ethics and the New Zealand Economy* (1987), *Hearts and Minds: A place for people in a market economy* (1992), and *A Word in Season: Reflections on spirituality, faith and ethics* (2008).

Richard was appointed a Companion of the New Zealand Order of Merit in 2004.

Now resident in Wellington, he is married to Jackie. They have three adult children and five grandchildren.

Gareth Jones CNZM (to October 2011)

Professor Gareth Jones is Director of the Bioethics Centre at the University of Otago, where he was Deputy Vice Chancellor (Academic and International) to the end of 2009. He is also Professor of Anatomy and Structural Biology. He qualified in medicine and neuroscience (BSc Hons, MBBS) at University College London, and has DSc and MD degrees from the University of Western Australia and the University of Otago, in science and bioethics respectively. He was made a Companion of the New Zealand Order of Merit in 2004 for his contributions to science and education.

Gareth has published extensively in neuroscience, anatomy education and bioethics. His recent publications include: *Speaking for the Dead: The human body in biology and medicine* (co-author, second edition, 2009), *Medical Ethics* (co-author, 4th edition, 2005), *Designers of the Future* (2005), *Bioethics* (2007), *A Tangled Web: Medicine and theology in dialogue* (co-editor, 2009), and *A Glass Darkly: Medicine and theology in further dialogue* (co-editor, 2010).

Appendix 2: Member attendance at full ACART meetings

Member	8 Jul 2011	9 Sep 2011	14 Oct 2011	18 Nov 2011	9 Mar 2012	11 May 2012
Sylvia Rumball	~	А	✓			
Richard Randerson	~	~	~			
Gareth Jones	~	~	А			
John Angus	~	✓	~	✓	✓	~
Karen Buckingham	~	✓	~	✓	✓	~
Alison Douglass	~	✓	~	✓	✓	~
Cilla Henry	~	~	~	✓	✓	А
Nikki Horne	~	~	✓	✓	✓	~
Andrew Shelling	~	✓	~	✓	✓	~
Michael Legge				~	✓	~
Judy Turner				~	✓	~
Total members present	9/9	8/9	8/9	8/8	8/8	8/9

✓ Present

A Apologies

Appendix 3: ACART working groups

Working group	Responsibilities and meeting dates		
Import and Export of Gametes and Embryos Working Group Andrew Shelling (Chair)	Continuing work on proposed advice to the Minister on the import and export of gametes and embryos under sections 38 and 39 of the HART Act		
Cilla Henry Karen Buckingham Michael Legge	Met in April 2012		
Alison Douglass Informed Consent Working Group John Angus (Chair) Michael Legge Nikki Horne Cilla Henry Alison Douglass	Recommendations to ACART on policy positions in respect of informed consent as it applies to assisted reproductive treatment and human reproductive research Met in February 2012		
Surrogacy Guidelines Review Working Group John Angus (Chair) Nikki Horne Judy Turner Andrew Shelling Karen Buckingham	Recommendations to ACART on policy positions in respect of the review of ACART's surrogacy and family gamete donation guidelines, as part of addressing a complaint to the Human Rights Commission Met in February and April 2012		
Extended Storage Working Group Richard Randerson Sylvia Rumball (Chair) John Angus	Recommendations to ACART on draft guidelines on the extended storage of gametes and embryos and recommending finalised guidelines to ACART for consultation with the Minister of Health Met in August 2011		